Enrolment Officer's Reply Submission in response to a Responding Submission by an Interested Party:

Report Regarding Ancestor Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) dated March 1, 2023



Joan Holmes, Enrolment Officer for AOO Prepared for the Algonquin Tribunal March 2023

Contents

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Document #3 – Responding Submission by V. Coburn	4
	2.1 Comments on Family History submitted by C. Paquette	4
	2.2 Genealogical Chart for Jacques Paquet/Paquette	4
	2.3 Introduction and Comments on the Algonquins of Ontario (AOO) Proposed Enrolment Criteria, and Methodology (Respondent's sections 01 to 07)	5
	2.4 Respondent's Section 08 and 09 – Jacques Paquette: Root Ancestor to the Clouthier, Paquet, Turcot and related families	5
	2.5 Identification of Parents, Grandparents and Earlier Generations	5
	2.6 Respondent's section 12 – UNDRIP, the History of Indian Act and its Precursors, and the Proposed Beneficiary Criteria	
	2.7 1825 Census	6
	2.8 Respondent's Conclusions	6

1. Introduction

The Tribunal received a responding submission from one individual in support of removing the ancestor Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) from the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors. The submission is posted on the Tribunal's website at:

https://www.tanakiwin.com/tribunal/josephpaquette/

The submission appears on the website as:

• Document 3 – Responding Submission by V. Coburn. It was dated January 17, 2023.

Mr. Coburn's submission is responding to the Initial Submission by C. Paquette and the Enrolment Officer's Report which appear on the Tribunal website as:

- Document 1 Enrolment Officer's Report Regarding Ancestor Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371). It was dated September 2022.
- Document 2 Initial Submission by C. Paquette. It was dated November 15, 2022.

The Enrolment Officer's reply to the Initial Submission by C. Paquette appears on the Tribunal website as Document 4 – Enrolment Officer's Reply to Initial Submission Regarding Joseph Paquette (RIN 1371). It was dated January 30, 2023. This report post-dated the responding submission of Mr. Coburn.

This reply report addresses the content of the responding submission that is relevant to the Tribunal's inquiry, which is to determine whether Joseph Paquette is identified in a historic record or document dated on or before December 31, 1921, in such a way that it would be reasonable to conclude that he was considered to be an Algonquin or Nipissing, or a sibling of such a person. A "sibling of such a person" means a person with a common Algonquin parent.

This reply does not comment on sections of the submission that pertain to the history of enrolment, research methodology, the application of oral history and circumstantial evidence, or the reliability of DNA analysis. Nor does it comment on information submitted or conclusions drawn by the respondent regarding descendants of the subject ancestors or family lines intermarried with them as these is not issues before the Tribunal. Whether or not individuals can be properly enrolled under the Proposed Beneficiary Criteria (PBC) will be determined after the Tribunal has concluded their work and all protests and appeals have been adjudicated.

Mr. Coburn's responding submission refers to some documents and facts that are contained in the Enrolment Officer's Report (Document 1), the Enrolment Officer's Responding Report (Document 4) and the Initial submission by C. Paquette (Document 2). As noted in the Enrolment Officer's Report, archival documents recording a family's life events have been assigned ALG document numbers; RIN numbers have been assigned to individuals discussed in the report to aid in identification. RIN numbers and/or page numbers of existing reports will be referenced in this report for ease of discussion.

2. Document #3 – Responding Submission by V. Coburn

The respondent, V. Coburn, submitted a report to the Tribunal in support of removing Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) from the Schedule of Ancestors. The submission was sent under cover of a letter dated January 17, 2023 and included a 199-page report dated May 1, 2021 (revised). The report included written text, genealogical charts, lists by generation, and supporting genealogical documents.

This reply report comments on the content of the submission that is within the purview of the Enrolment Officer to address and is germane to the issues before the Tribunal. The issues raised by the respondent are organized into sub-sections. Some individuals discussed by the respondent are identified by RIN numbers for ease of identification.

2.1 Comments on Family History submitted by C. Paquette

In reference to the Initial Submission by C. Paquette, the respondent submits that the "question of Joseph Paquette's Algonquin identity is not borne out in family lore and other stories." The Enrolment Officer does not disagree with this statement, as indicated on page 8 of the Enrolment Officer's Responding Report dated January 30, 2023 posted as Document 4 on the Tribunal website.

2.2 Genealogical Chart for Jacques Paquet/Paquette

This genealogical chart provides a family tree for Jacques Paquette (1800-1859, RIN #14047) documenting six to eight generations of ancestors on both his maternal and paternal lines. The chart shows Jacques' parents, Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371) who married Marie Helen Barette (1766-1845, RIN #8771), his paternal grandparents Joseph Paquet (1753-1813, RIN #31074) and his wife Marie Elizabeth Rose (1743-1815, RIN #31075) and his other ancestors on each line.

The Enrolment Officer's report (Document 1) included a genealogical chart in Appendix 1 showing five generation of descendants from Joseph Paquet (1753-1813, RIN #31074) and his wife Marie Elizabeth Rose (1743-1815, RIN #31075) to his son Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371) who married Marie Helen Barette (1766-1845, RIN #8771). The chart also shows Joseph and Marie Helen's children including siblings: Joseph (1785-1832, RIN #29633); Alexis (1793-1857, RIN #29635); and Jacques (1800-1859, RIN #14047). The respondent's chart is a much broader and more detailed coverage of the entire ancestral group of Jacques Paquet (1800-1859, RIN #14047) and his father Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371) and mother Marie Helen Barette (1766-1845, RIN #8771).

Joseph Paquet (RIN #31074) and his wife Marie Elizabeth Rose (RIN #31075) also had a son Alexis Paquette (born 1772, RIN #31078) who married Marie Marguerite Cloutier (RIN #29632) in 1794. This Alexis was the brother of Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371). That relationship is shown on the genealogical chart in The Enrolment Officer's report (Document 1) in Appendix 1.

The ancestor under review is Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371). Joseph's brother Alexis Paquet (RIN #31078) and Joseph's son Jacques (RIN #14047) are also discussed in the Enrolment Officer's reports, as they are the ancestors from whom individuals seeking enrolment are descended. See discussion on pages 6 to 7 of the Enrolment Officer's report posted as Document 1 on the Tribunal's website.

2.3 Introduction and Comments on the Algonquins of Ontario (AOO) Proposed Enrolment Criteria, and Methodology (Respondent's sections 01 to 07)

The content of the initial seven sections of the respondent's report are taken from information posted on the AOO's website, the respondent's comments and interpretations of the history of enrolment, comments on the application of oral history and circumstantial evidence, an explanation of why genealogy is the most reliable determinant, and comments on the reliability of DNA analysis. This reply report is not commenting on these sections as they are not directly germane to the issue before the tribunal which is to determine whether Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) is identified in a historic record or document dated on or before December 31, 1921, in such a way that it would be reasonable to conclude that he was considered to be an Algonquin or Nipissing, or a sibling of such a person. A "sibling of such a person" means a person with a common Algonquin parent.

2.4 Respondent's Section 08 and 09 – Jacques Paquette: Root Ancestor to the Clouthier, Paquet, Turcot and related families

This section discusses family lines that are descended from or intermarried with descendants of the ancestors at issue and the appropriateness of the enrolment of individuals from these families. This reply report is not commenting on these sections as they are not directly germane to the issue before the tribunal which is to determine whether Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) is identified in a historic record or document dated on or before December 31, 1921, in such a way that it would be reasonable to conclude that he was considered to be an Algonquin or Nipissing, or a sibling of such a person. A "sibling of such a person" means a person with a common Algonquin parent.

2.5 Identification of Parents, Grandparents and Earlier Generations

Sections 10 to 11 of the respondent's report focus on identifying the parents of Jacques Paquet (1800-1859, RIN #14047), being Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371) and Magdeleine Barette (1766-1845, RIN #8771). These sections also discuss Jacques' siblings Joseph (1785-1832, RIN #29633) and Alexis (1793-1857, RIN #29635). The Enrolment Officer does not disagree with the information in this section regarding the ancestors of these men as it accords with the observations made in the Enrolment Officer's report (Document 1) at pages 7-11 and summarized in the Enrolment Officer's Reply (Document 4) at pages 5-6.

2.6 Respondent's section 12 – UNDRIP, the History of Indian Act and its Precursors, and the Proposed Beneficiary Criteria

This reply report does not comment on these sections as they are not directly germane to the issue before the tribunal which is to determine whether Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) is identified in a historic record or document dated on or before December 31, 1921, in such a

way that it would be reasonable to conclude that he was considered to be an Algonquin or Nipissing, or a sibling of such a person. A "sibling of such a person" means a person with a common Algonquin parent.

2.7 1825 Census

Appendix 2 of the respondent's report (image page 183 of 199) addresses the name on the 1825 census of the Algonquin Village at the Lake of Two Mountains Mission. The Respondent notes the name on the census as Joseph Payette, not Joseph Paquette.

The Enrolment Officer's reports (Document 1 and Document 4) reach the same conclusion. Furthermore, the Enrolment Officer's research could not locate any person by the name of either Joseph Paquet/Paquette or Payette/Payet that would have been reasonably associated with the Lake of Two Mountains census of 1825 from which the ancestor was identified for addition to the Schedule of Ancestors when it was created in 1994. The genealogical records related to the subject ancestor, Joseph Paquette (RIN #11371) and his family indicate that they were located elsewhere.

2.8 Respondent's Conclusions

The respondent concludes that genealogical records indicate that Jacques Paquette (1800-1859 RIN #14047), Alexis Paquette (1793-1857, RIN #29635) and Joseph Paquette (1785-1832, RIN #29633) are the sons of Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371) and Magdeleine Barette (1766-1845, RIN #8771) and that they can be traced to persons who immigrated from Europe (predominantly from France) and have no Algonquin ancestor.

As noted in the Enrolment Officer's report dated September 2022 (Document 1) and the Enrolment Officer's responding report of January 30, 2023 (Document 4), the Enrolment Officer does not disagree with this conclusion.

The respondent's report does not address Alexis Paquette (born 1772, RIN #31078) who married Marie Marguerite Cloutier (RIN #29632) in 1794 and who is the full sibling of Joseph Paquet (1761-1818, RIN #11371). As Joseph (RIN #11371) and Alexis (RIN #31078) are brothers who share common parents, they also share the same ancestry.