

**Enrolment Officer's Responding Report made in response to the Initial
Submissions by Interested Parties:**

**Report Regarding Ancestor
Michel McDonald
(RIN #14703)
dated March 30, 2023**



**Joan Holmes, Enrolment Officer for AOO
Prepared for the Algonquin Tribunal
March 2023**

Contents

1. Introduction	4
2. Document #2 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury	4
2.1 Introduction	4
2.2 Census Records and related records	5
2.3 Death of Elizabeth McDonald	7
2.4 Children of Peter McDonald	7
2.5 Mother of Mary Anne Peters.....	8
2.6 Relations with other Algonquins.....	8
2.7 Sarah (Serry) Whiteduck (RIN #2339).....	9
2.8 Family Oral History.....	10
3. Document #3 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury	10
3.1 Introduction	10
3.2 Connections to other Algonquins	10
3.3 Origins on the Census Records	10
3.4 Death of Elizabeth McDonald	11
3.5 Peter McDonald marriage.....	11
3.6 Birth records for Xavier and Michel (Peter), 1879 & 1881	11
4. Document #4 – Initial Submission by M. de Braux.....	12
5. Document #5 – Initial Submission by H. Majaury.....	12
5.1 Introduction	12
5.2 Process so far	12
5.3 Impact statement.....	12
5.4 Family Relationships and Direct Lineage	13
5.5 Michel McDonald’s parent.....	14
5.6 Fair and Equitable Treatment	14
5.7 200 Year Stretch.....	14
5.8 Elizabeth McDonald nee Arkle Arcol Arcand	14
5.9 Relationships.....	14
5.10 Manitoba.....	15
5.11 Michel McDonald’s Previous Marriages	15
5.12 Modern Period – Petition Period	15
5.13 Identity and Belonging	15

5.14 In Conclusion..... 15
Appendix A: Supporting Document List for Michel McDonald..... 16
Appendix B: Supporting Document Package for Michel McDonald..... 17

1. Introduction

The Tribunal received four responding submissions from individuals in support of retaining the ancestor Michel McDonald (RIN #14703) on the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors. The submissions are posted on the Tribunal's website at:

<https://www.tanakiwin.com/tribunal/michel-mcdonald-3/>

They appear on the website as:

- Document 2 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury
- Document 3 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury
- Document 4 – Initial Submission by M. de Braux
- Document 5 – Initial Submission by H. Majaury

The submissions are responding to the Enrolment Officer's Report which appears on the Tribunal website as:

- Document 1 – Enrolment Officer Report Regarding Michel McDonald & Appendices.

This reply report addresses the content in the Respondents' submissions that are relevant to the Tribunal's inquiry, which is to determine whether Michel McDonald (RIN #14703) is identified in a historic record or document dated on or before December 31, 1921, in such a way that it would be reasonable to conclude that he was considered to be an Algonquin or Nipissing, or a sibling of such a person. A "sibling of such a person" means a person with a common Algonquin parent.

This reply comments only on the content of the Respondents' submissions that are within the purview of the Enrolment Officer.

The Respondents' submissions refer to some documents and facts that are contained in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1). As noted in the Enrolment Officer's Report, archival documents recording a family's life events have been assigned ALG document numbers; RIN numbers have been assigned to individuals discussed in the report to aid in identification. RIN numbers, ALG document numbers, and/or page numbers of existing reports are referenced in this report for ease of discussion.

2. Document #2 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury

2.1 Introduction

The Respondent B. Majaury submitted a report to the Tribunal in support of retaining Michel McDonald (RIN #14703) on the Schedule of Ancestors. The submission, sent under cover letter dated August 22, 2022, included a narrative and some archival documents related to his ancestor Michel McDonald.

The Respondent asked on what basis did the Algonquin Negotiation Representatives (ANRs) challenge the 2013 decision of Justice Chadwick. The ANRs passed a Special Resolution on April

20, 2021 (Motion 20210420-1) which established the Tribunal and its mandate. The establishment of the Tribunal authorized it to hear appeals and protests, including those related to ancestors on the Schedule of Ancestors. It was anticipated in a Special Resolution dated January 22, 2020 (Motion 20200122-1). The Special Resolution of April 20, 2021 specifies in section 77 that: "Any matter brought to the Tribunal for determination shall be heard and be determined as a new proceeding, but this does not preclude the Tribunal from considering decisions made by other decision-making bodies including with respect to past enrolment processes."

The Respondent attached some reports and correspondence from the Enrolment Officer that pre-dated the establishment of the Tribunal. This material is superseded by the Enrolment Officer's Report to the Tribunal (posted as Document 1).

This reply report comments on the content of the submission that is within the purview of the Enrolment Officer to address and is germane to the issues before the Tribunal. The issues raised by the Respondent are organized into sub-sections. Some individuals discussed by the Respondent are identified by RIN numbers for ease of identification.

2.2 Census Records and related records

Several issues were raised by the Respondent regarding the information listed on census records. These concerns include the fact that the census records contain contradictory or inconsistent information regarding Michel McDonald's place of birth and ethnic origin or identity. The Respondent suggested that these variations may have resulted from Michel McDonald's inability to read or write and his limited use and knowledge of English. The Respondent indicated that Michel spoke broken English, "possibly French" and "could communicate in Algonquin." The Respondent doubts that he would be aware of the Province of Manitoba that had just been created at the time of the 1871 census.

No primary records show the name of Michel McDonald's parents, nor has a birth or baptism record been located. Therefore, information related to his origins are limited to information recorded several decades after his birth (estimated to be around 1836-1840), such as marriage and census records.

Issues regarding the census information is referenced throughout the Respondent's submission. In the interest of completeness and for ease of comparison, this reply report will address all of the extant census records and documents that address origins under this sub-heading. The records held in the Enrolment Office include the following.

- The 1866 record of Michel McDonald's marriage to Mary Wilduck (RIN #7749) is the earliest known document to record a birthplace for Michel McDonald. The civil return states his place of birth as "Canada." They were married in a Roman Catholic church.¹

¹ ALG-40176 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.1 on page 5. The church record is ALG-01437.

- The 1871 census states that Michel was born in Manitoba and was “Scotch” in origin. He was said to be Roman Catholic and hunter/farmer. His wife was noted as Indian and unable to read or write; Michel was not so noted.²

Manitoba became a province in 1870 when it joined Confederation. Prior to that time the province consisted of only the southern portion below Lake Winnipeg, originally referred to as the Red River Settlement. The boundaries of Manitoba were expanded in 1881 and 1912. It was recognized as a distinct province by time the 1871 census was taken. The terms used to describe different geo-political regions typically matched the time of writing rather than the time of past events. In other words, territorial and provincial divisions were usually described in census material according to how the area was known at the time of the census, not earlier periods when events (such as births) took place.

- The 1881 census states that Michel was born in “O” for Ontario. In the Origin column he was noted as “Scotch ~~Ind~~”. The word “Ind” for Indian was struck through. He was identified as a hunter and Roman Catholic.³ We have no information on why “Ind” was struck out, although this has been observed on other census records in this time period. It is possible that it was done not by the enumerator, but by the official who compiled the statistic from the census returns.

The census taker was instructed to record the information as given by the head of household. The reality of the early census experience was that the information was sometimes collected from another person found in the household, neighbours, or recorded on the basis of the census taker's personal knowledge of the family and its members. This was especially true in remote areas where individuals were away from their households or had difficulty communicating.

- The 1891 census states that Michel was born in Canada as were both his parents. Under the column for French Canadian, the word “Indian” is written and repeated for the rest of the family (as denoted by the numeral “1”). There was no other origin question on 1891 census. Michel is shown as Roman Catholic and a hunter. Both he and his wife are noted as being able to read and write. Two of the children aged 9 and 10 are noted as being able to read, while the 11-year-old is shown as not being able to do either.⁴
- The 1901 census states that Michel was born in “Man r” (meaning rural Manitoba). His origin given as Cree FB (meaning Cree French Breed). No colour is noted for Michel or his children; he is a widower at this point. All other persons enumerated on this page (50 in total) were shown as W for White or R for Red (Indigenous). Michel is enumerated as Roman Catholic and a farmer. He is shown as speaking both English and French but

² ALG-27242 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.1 on page 7.

³ ALG-27243 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 10.

⁴ ALG-27248 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 11.

not being able to read or write. The only member of the family that can read and write is a 12-year-old daughter; the 10-year-old can read but not write. No mother tongue is recorded for Michel's family, although this column is completed for all other persons on this census sheet.⁵ Serry Whiteduck is enumerated as living with Michel's family. Although she has been definitively proven to be Algonquin she is also recorded as Cree FB. Serry Whiteduck is discussed in detail below in subsection 2.6.

As noted in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) on page 20, the instruction on the 1901 census was for the enumerator to record the "country or place of birth" specifying that "(If in Canada specify Province or Territory and add 'r' or 'u' for rural or urban as the case may be)". Michel was recorded in 1901 as "Man r" which was indicated in the instructions as the appropriate abbreviation for rural Manitoba.

- Michel McDonald's 1907 death record notes him as being born in Canada. His son John gave the information for this death record.⁶
- On the 1921 census, the adult sons of Michel McDonald (George, Peter, and John Christmas) all gave the birthplace of their father as Ontario and their own ethnic origins as Indian.⁷ Michel's daughter Elizabeth's origin was listed as French; her father's birthplace as Ontario. She was noted as speaking "Indian." Elizabeth was living with her husband on the Mud Lake Reserve, now known as Curve Lake, a Mississauga community.⁸

2.3 Death of Elizabeth McDonald

The death record for Elizabeth Arcle (the third wife of Michel McDonald, aka Elizabeth Arcand, RIN #14704) is cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1). It shows that Elizabeth Arcle died on July 19, 1893, the day of Joseph Alfred's birth.⁹

2.4 Children of Peter McDonald

Peter McDonald (RIN #18305) was the son of Michel McDonald. The Respondent noted that Peter McDonald had three children with his first wife, Catherine Pierre (RIN #19131), and six children with his second wife, Annie Payea (RIN #18306).

The Respondent's mother reportedly referred to Catherine Pierre as Jocko. The records in the Enrolment Office support the use of the Jocko name. Primary documents show that Catherine Pierre (1882-1918, RIN #19131) was the daughter of William Pierre (RIN #19184) and Marie Anne Jacob (1854-1888, RIN #5471). Marie Anne Jacob, Catherine Pierre's mother, was the daughter of François Jocko (RIN #5468) and Mani Whiteduck (RIN #5469), which explains her

⁵ ALG-07859 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

⁶ ALG-27253 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

⁷ ALG-27507, ALG-27650, ALG-40206, respectively, cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.4 on page 13.

⁸ ALG-40208 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.4 on page 14.

⁹ ALG-40177 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

being known as Jocko.¹⁰ Both of Catherine's parents were descendants of documented Algonquins making Catherine the descendant of several ancestors on the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors, including Ignace Kijikomanito (RIN #6643), Jacques Kamiskwabinnich (RIN #7189), Jacques Pekakasaketch (RIN #6527), and Mathias Cabakkawatc (RIN #6390).

2.5 Mother of Mary Anne Peters

John Christmas McDonald (RIN # #14633), the son of Michel McDonald, married Mary Anne Peters (born 1894-1960, RIN #14634). The Respondent states that Mary Anne Peters was the daughter of Phoebe Kelford (aka Kelfert, RIN #15193) whose mother Jane (aka Mary Kelford) was also the mother of Joe Whiteduck. Thus, Mary Anne Peters was said to be the niece of Joe Whiteduck.

The Enrolment Officer has very few records for Mary Ann Peters. She has been documented as living from 1894 to 1960, the daughter of Stephen Peters and Phoebe Kelfert (RIN #15193). No further information has been documented.

The Respondent referenced the Rosenberger Papers, which is a lengthy research paper under date of January 19, 2010. Those papers reference the 1914 marriage record of Joseph Whiteduck, called Kelford, who was the son of Joseph Whiteduck and Mary Kelford.¹¹ The Respondent provided this 1914 marriage record for Joe Whiteduck and Loretta Manion. According to the marriage record, Joe Whiteduck was 20 years old at the time of the marriage putting his date of birth around 1894. The marriage record shows the name of the groom as "Joseph Whiteduck (called Kelford)" but does not name his parents.¹² Additional documents would be required to link Mary Ann Peters to the Whiteduck family.

Steven Peters (born 1864) and his wife Phoebe Peters (born 1874) and their four young children are living next door to Michel McDonald and his children in 1901, as shown on the 1901 census. Their children are shown on the census as: A. Marry born July 3, 1894; F. Robert born March 16, 1896; Steven born December 26, 1897; and W. John born March 3, 1900.¹³ It is likely that the daughter "A. Marry Peters" born in 1894 as shown on this census return became the wife of John Christmas McDonald.

2.6 Relations with other Algonquins

The relationship between Michel McDonald and documented Algonquins is discussed in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) in Section E.2 on pages 7 to 8 and depicted on page 9. These relationships include Michel McDonald's first two wives (cousins Mary Whiteduck and Mary Constant), and their cousin and aunt (Sarah Whiteduck and Theresa

¹⁰ The name Jocko was frequently rendered as Jacob in the 19th century records regarding these Algonquin families.

¹¹ ALG-40571

¹² ALG-40572

¹³ ALG-07859 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

Whiteduck, respectively), as well as Michel McDonald's son's marriage to the daughter of another cousin.

The Respondent states that Sarah (Serry) Whiteduck was in the Michel McDonald household looking after the children after the death of their mother in 1893 and further states that this proves a relationship between her and all of the children. He further states that since Sarah was the first cousin of Michel's first two wives, there can be little doubt that there had been a long-term relationship with the family.

2.7 Sarah (Serry) Whiteduck (RIN #2339)

As noted above, the 1901 census return shows Serry (Sarah) Whiteduck and her infant daughter living in the Michel McDonald household in 1901. Like Michel McDonald, she was enumerated as Cree fb (Cree French Breed).¹⁴ As noted by the Respondent she was recorded on the 1911 census as "Algonquin" and speaking "Indian."¹⁵

Michel McDonald died in 1907; his death record noted that he died of "general debility" and that he had been sick for seven years.¹⁶ This indicated that his health was failing at the time Sarah was living in the household in 1901 when four sons, aged 15 to 20 years old, and two daughters, aged 10 and 12, were still living at home.

The identity of Sarah Whiteduck was investigated by the genealogist in the Enrolment Office at length. The findings, based on primary documents, are outlined below and are described in Section E.5 of the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1), show that Sarah Whiteduck was clearly an Algonquin woman.

Sarah Whiteduck (1869-1937, RIN #2339) was the daughter of Simon Whiteduck and Therese Jacob and a descendant of ancestors Joseph Pekakasiketch (RIN #6527), Jacques Kamiskwabininch (RIN #7189), Mathias Cabakkawatc (RIN #6390), and François Jacob/Jacko (RIN #5468) who are all on the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors.

Despite her fully documented origins as Algonquin, she is enumerated on the 1901 census with the Michel McDonald family as "Cree fb".¹⁷ Ten years later, she is enumerated on the 1911 census, living with her sister and brother-in-law as "Algonquin" and speaking "Indian."¹⁸

The characterization of Sarah Whiteduck in 1901 as Cree French Breed when she was without a doubt Algonquin brings into question the identification of Michel McDonald as Cree French Breed.

¹⁴ ALG-07859 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

¹⁵ ALG-27659 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.5 on pages 15-16.

¹⁶ ALG-27253 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

¹⁷ ALG-07859 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

¹⁸ ALG-27659 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.5 on page 16.

2.8 Family Oral History

The Respondent notes that Elizabeth Whetung nee McDonald, the daughter of Michel McDonald, spoke fluent Anishinabemowen (a recovered term for Algonquian languages such as Algonquin, Mississauga, Ojibwa). Note that the 1921 census listed Elizabeth as speaking "Indian."¹⁹ Elizabeth told her grandson Brent Whetung that Michel McDonald had deep scars on his back from being beaten as a child.

The Enrolment Officer has no comments on family oral history.

3. Document #3 – Initial Submission by B. Majaury

3.1 Introduction

The Respondent made a submission to the Tribunal dated November 2022. The content of the submission repeated much of the information detailed in his earlier submission (posted as Document 2). Issues raised that are within the purview of the Enrolment Officer and germane to the mandate of the Tribunal are reviewed under similar headings.

3.2 Connections to other Algonquins

The Respondent notes that there is no documentation that shows Michel McDonald "was closely associated with any Cree or Ojibwa people, only Algonquin people." Furthermore, the Respondent states that all the records provided by the Enrolment Officer show Michel McDonald "living in traditional Algonquin territory, associated with Algonquin people." The Enrolment Officer confirms that documents demonstrate these points. Michel McDonald was also associated with non-Indigenous people, such as his third wife.

3.3 Origins on the Census Records

The Respondent questions the accuracy of the information recorded on the census records stating that he had difficulty reconciling Michel's life as an illiterate man in rural Ontario to a man having knowledge of being born thirty years prior in a distant province only recently established as Manitoba, especially in view of the fact that he did not know his parents' names. The Respondent further notes that no record of his birth or baptism has been located and his sons stated he was born in Ontario.

Section 2.2, above, regarding census records list the various places in which he was said to have been born which include Ontario (1881 census) and Manitoba (1871 and 1901 census). Four adult children identified his place of birth as Ontario on their 1921 census returns (George, Peter, John Christmas, and Elizabeth). Other records merely show his place of birth and that of his parents as Canada. The 1871 and 1891 census returns indicate that he could read and write; while the 1901 census states that he could not.

¹⁹ ALG-40208 cited in the Enrolment Officers Report, Section E.4 on page 14.

3.4 Death of Elizabeth McDonald

The Respondent states the Sarah Whiteduck, a relative of Michel's first two wives, was living with the family to assist in running the household after the death of Michel's wife, Elizabeth Arkle. The death record for Elizabeth Arkle is cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1). It shows that Elizabeth Arkle died on July 19, 1893, the day of Joseph Alfred's birth.²⁰ Serry (Sarah) Whiteduck is shown on the 1901 census as living with the family. She is enumerated as a "servant."²¹ On the 1901 census, the options for household members who were not related by blood or marriage to the head of household were "servant, boarder, or lodger." It is most likely that none of those categories described the relationship of Sarah Whiteduck to Michel McDonald and his children.

It is possible that Sarah Whiteduck was in a conjugal relationship with Michel McDonald. Recall that Michel was noted as married on his 1908 death record, although his wife Elizabeth Arkle had died in 1893. This information was given by his son John. There is no proof of the actual relationship between Michel and Sarah.

Sarah Whiteduck is discussed in Section 2.7, above.

3.5 Peter McDonald marriage

The Respondent submits that the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) states that Peter McDonald married his second cousin, Catherine Pierre. This is an error in the Enrolment Officer's Report. The sentence should have read "Marie Anne was a cousin of Michel McDonald's first and second wives, making Peter's bride a first cousin once removed of the wives." The cousin relationship is between Catherine Pierre's mother Marie Ann and the first and second wives of Peter's father. This relationship is depicted on the chart on page 9.

3.6 Birth records for Xavier and Michel (Peter), 1879 & 1881

The Respondent notes that Michel and his children were identified as Scotch on the 1881 census, with Michel recorded as "Scotch ~~and~~". Records for the births of two sons in 1879 and 1881 record Michel as "Indian." The civil registry document cited by the Respondent is not attached; however, these records were retrieved by the Enrolment Office. The November 15, 1879 civil birth registration for Xavier Michel (RIN #14705) lists Michel McDonald and Eliza Arkle as the parents. The "Rank or Profession of Father" is listed as "Yeoman (Indian)".²² The term yeoman was used to denote a farmer. The December 10, 1881 civil birth registration for "Michele," a boy, lists Michel McDonald and Eliza Arkle as the parents. The "Rank or Profession of Father" is listed as "Indian."²³ While the boy on this record is recorded as "Michele" the birth date of the child is the same as Michel and Eliza's son, Peter Abraham (RIN #18305).

²⁰ ALG-40177 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

²¹ ALG-07859 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 12.

²² ALG-40573

²³ ALG-40574

The preponderance of evidence show that Michel McDonald was Indigenous; the issue is whether he was Algonquin, Cree, Ojibwa or from some other nation.

4. Document #4 – Initial Submission by M. de Braux

The Respondent M. de Braux made a submission to the Tribunal in support of retaining ancestor Michel McDonald (RIN #14703) on the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors.

The Respondent described her descent from ancestor Michel McDonald. The details are as documented in the Enrolment Office database. Family oral history recounts her grandfather being subjected to discrimination and racial prejudice. The Respondent recounted details of the lives of her grandfather, mother and herself and supplied family pictures. The Respondent also described the history of her enrolment and comments on the Enrolment Process.

The Enrolment Officer has no comments on family oral history or family pictures. The Enrolment Officer has no comments on the enrolment process as it is not germane to the issue before the Tribunal.

5. Document #5 – Initial Submission by H. Majaury

The Respondent H. Majaury made a submission to the Tribunal dated February 21, 2023 in support of retaining ancestor Michel McDonald (RIN #14703) on the Schedule of Algonquin Ancestors. The Enrolment Officer comments on material supplied and issues raised that are within the purview of Enrolment Officer and are germane to the mandate of the Tribunal. The submission is addressed under sub-headings used by the Respondent in her submission.

5.1 Introduction

This section provided background on the Respondent's life and experience.

The Enrolment Officer has no comment on this section.

5.2 Process so far

The Respondent provides a summary of the family's experience with the Enrolment process and family life on the territory.

The Enrolment Officer has no comments on the enrolment process, personal experiences or family oral history.

5.3 Impact statement

The Respondent describes the impact on the family of the ancestor under review and comments on the history of the Enrolment process. This section also includes photographs of family members in the graveyard in which Michel McDonald and his wife Eliza Arcle are buried.

Regarding the Respondent's comment on page 27 of her submission that Stage 2 of the Enrolment process "has never materialized," it should be noted that the establishment of the

Tribunal is part of Stage 2 of the Enrolment process and is affording the interested parties the opportunity to respond to challenges to the Ancestors on the Schedule of Ancestors who were referred to the Tribunal for adjudication. Michel McDonald is one of those ancestors.

The enumeration of Michel McDonald on census records is outlined in detail in Section 2.2, above.

The Enrolment Officer has no other comments on this section.

5.4 Family Relationships and Direct Lineage

The Respondent supplied family photo(s), recounted some details of family history and oral tradition in this section.

A screen shot of the 1921 census is referenced in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) and discussed in section 2.2 above.²⁴

Oral family history cited by the Respondent states that Michel McDonald "took on, or adopted, the surname McDonald around the age of sixteen" (pages 47 and 50).

The Respondent included a screen shot of the baptismal record for John Christmas McDonald, who is the son of Michel McDonald and Eliza Arcle. This document is discussed in the Enrolment Officer's Report at Section E.3.²⁵

Reference is made to the enumeration on the 1861 census of Wilberforce Township of a young man named Michel McDonald/O'Donald, an 18-year-old in the household of Richard McDonald/O'Donald. He was listed as a labourer. The household was identified as Irish with the father and oldest child born in Ireland and the rest of the family born in Ontario. The Respondent believes that this is their ancestor. The 1861 census in question was cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1). Note that the Michel in this household and two of the young females (15 & 13) were noted as family members that were absent. The 13-year-old girl was shown as being at school; the whereabouts of the other girl and Michel was not noted.²⁶ Their being absent was likely why they were listed at the end of the household list. No further evidence has been located that connects this person with the ancestor Michel McDonald.

Family oral history states the Michel McDonald's mother "was from somewhere on the French River or they had lived there at one time. At some point she did go to live with the boy's (Michel) father's family" (page 53). There is also a story of Michel and his mother working on a farm where they were mistreated (pages 54 to 55).

²⁴ ALG-01492 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 11.

²⁵ ALG-01492 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 11.

²⁶ ALG-40220 cited in the Enrolment Officer's Report, Section F on page 21.

The Respondent references the "Rosenburg research" on pages 55 to 64. The research regarding the connection between the names Whiteduck and Kelford is discussed in Section 2.5 above. The history of this family does not assist in determining Michel McDonald's ancestry. If substantiated, it shows a relationship between two families (McDonald and Kelford/Whiteduck).

5.5 Michel McDonald's parent

The Respondent states that the parents of Michel McDonald are unknown and challenges the appropriateness of the review of his file. References to challenges against other ancestors are not germane to the consideration of ancestor Michel McDonald.

The Respondent provides information on attempts to locate additional documentation on the Michel McDonald family. No new documents were located.

5.6 Fair and Equitable Treatment

The Respondent suggests the descendants of Michel McDonald were expelled from the process while descendants of other challenged ancestors were not. It should be noted here that some descendants of Michel McDonald did meet the Proposed Beneficiary Criteria (PBC) and some did not. Failure to meet all the criteria was not dependent on ancestor Michel McDonald being questioned but on lack of evidence to demonstrate one of the other elements of the PBC.

5.7 200 Year Stretch

The Respondent queried certain elements or aspects of the Proposed Beneficiary Criteria (PBC).

The Enrolment Officer has no comments as these are not issues before the Tribunal.

5.8 Elizabeth McDonald nee Arkle Arcol Arcand

The Respondent notes that they have been unable to identify Michel McDonald's parents. Suggestions that Elizabeth Arkle's mother was a Whiteduck have been disproven. Elizabeth Arkle's parents and natal family are documented in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) in Section E.6 on pages 17 to 20.

Elizabeth Arkle's 1893 death record is discussed in Section 2.3 above and in the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1).²⁷

5.9 Relationships

The Respondent supplies photographs and family oral history in this section.

The Enrolment Officer has no comments on family oral history or photographs.

²⁷ ALG-40177 cited in Enrolment Officer's Report, Section E.3 on page 11-12.

5.10 Manitoba

The Respondent challenges the conclusion that if Michel McDonald was born in Manitoba, he could not have been Algonquin. She cites other examples of known Algonquin people being mis-identified on census records.

The Enrolment Officer is also aware of census records in the Ottawa Valley that misidentify Algonquins who are well documented, such as listing them as belonging to another nation. The Enrolment Officer has no further comments on the discussion in this section.

5.11 Michel McDonald's Previous Marriages

The Respondent documented these marriages. Michel McDonald's first two marriages and the relationship between his first two wives is discussed in Section E.2 of the Enrolment Officer's Report (posted as Document 1) on pages 7 to 9. The findings are also summarized in Section 2.6 above.

5.12 Modern Period – Petition Period

The Respondent provides information about 20th century connections between her family and other Indigenous people.

The Enrolment Officer has no comment on this information.

5.13 Identity and Belonging

The Respondent provides information about spirituality and cultural aspects of Algonquin life.

The Enrolment Officer has no comment on this information.

5.14 In Conclusion

The Respondent presents her conclusions summarizing many of the points and concerns set out in her submission.

The Enrolment Officer has no comments on this section.

Appendix A: Supporting Document List for Michel McDonald

The documents in this table are listed by ALG number and appended in Appendix B.

Document Number	Document Date	Document Description	Reference
ALG-40571	2010-01-19	Rosenberger Research Paper	Rosenberger, Randy, and Dorothy Whiteduck Rosenberger. <i>Whiteduck Research Update</i> . January 19, 2010. Accessed March 29, 2023 at https://www.weskarini.ca/files/WhiteduckResearchPaper.pdf
ALG-40572	1914-09-22	Marriage of Joseph Whiteduck/Kelford and Loretta Manion	Archives of Ontario, Toronto, Registrations of Marriages, 1869-1928 Reel 320; Ancestry.ca Ontario, Canada, Marriages, 1826-1938 Renfrew > 1914 p. 406
ALG-40573	1879-11-15	Birth of Xavier Michel	Archives of Ontario, Toronto RG 80-2 Reel 377; Ancestry. ca Ontario, Canada Births, 1832-1916 Frontenac > 1874-1880 p. 1
ALG-40574	1881-12-10	Birth of Michele	Archives of Ontario, Toronto RG 80-2 Reel 48; Ancestry. ca Ontario, Canada Births, 1832-1916 Frontenac > 1874-1889 p. 83

Appendix B: Supporting Document Package for Michel McDonald

The documents are organized by ALG document number.
They appear in the same order as in the list in Appendix A and are bookmarked for ease of reference.

Research Paper

Rosenberger 1

Randy Rosenberger & Dorothy Whiteduck Rosenberger

Whiteduck Research Update

January 19, 2010.

Foreword

Before we begin we must state we are not writers. We have no formal training that will assist us in putting together the following material. We ask for indulgence and patience from the reader. It has been difficult to piece together much of the data, so it will be equally as difficult to lay it out in a cohesive and comprehensive manner at times. We do believe, however, that the data is valuable and worthy of putting to the written word. It is all too apparent from our years of looking for the past that files and records are easily lost. When we began, our plan was to simply provide the information as we discovered it - in a chronological order. However, as you read you will see that changed. At times it made more sense to include corroborating material, or records, even though they were discovered much later than the original. You will also notice that at times there appear to be duplicate records for events. Often events were recorded in more than one place and we feel including all sources is important as it adds credence to the data.

The Whiteduck and Associated Families

In October of 1996 we set out to research the Whiteduck family history. Since Dorothy's sister Patsy had attempted to obtain her status under the Indian Act and had completed some preliminary research, we began with a visit to her home in Iroquois Falls.

That visit netted us copies of the marriage certificate of Peter Whiteduck and Viola Joseph, Mary Whiteduck's death registration and a few other pieces of genealogical data. These were the beginnings of our search.

Before continuing we made a conscious decision that our primary objective would be to focus on learning as much as possible about the family's past. Any benefits derived from that heritage would remain secondary. With that in mind we set out on what continues to be a long and sometimes frustrating quest.

We needed a starting point from which we could develop a plan. In the material we obtained from Patsy we found a letter written by Floyd McQuestion from Deep River, Ontario. This man, a member of the Deep River Historical Society, had provided Patsy with some of the data she had on Mary Lamure Whiteduck. One of his suggestions was that she follow up through local churches for information. As this had not been done, we believed it to be the most logical first step. At the same time we decided to send out as many inquiries as possible to stir up leads. We would follow up on any positive leads as information was returned. A second matter of interest and importance was a notation on the death registration of Mary Lamure Whiteduck stating she was Algonquin. Dorothy had always known her ancestry included a native lineage, but knew nothing of its tribal origins. A third piece of valuable data was contained in the text of the newspaper article written at the time of Gabriel and Peter Whiteduck's deaths. In that article it was said that Gabriel had a brother who lived in Griffith, Ontario. At this point we knew the following:

Certificate of marriage:

- Joseph Whiteduck called Kelford - Joseph Kelford of the township of Cononto in the County of Frontenac, 20 years old, residing in Canonto Twp. since January 1, 1916, bachelor, son of Joseph Whiteduck and Mary Kelford, married Loretta Manion, residing in Palmerston township in the County of Frontenac, spinster, daughter of William Manion, farmer, and Margaret Doyle, in the village of Calabogie on September 22, 1914. Licence L MB10445, registered September 23, 1914, # 019463. Witnesses Thomas Dillon and Annie Killoran of Calabogie.

From St. Crysostome Catholic Church records, Arnprior, Ontario:

- Elizabeth Gerard Kelford (sometimes said Whiteduck) - May 1, 1927, we the undersigned priest baptized Elizabeth Gerard, daughter born on the 25th ult. of the lawful marriage of Joseph Kelford (Whiteduck struck through) and Loretta Manion. The sponsors were A. J. Lavern and Mrs. John Gillen. Priest James P. Whelan.

From Prov. of Ontario, Registrations of Marriages, District of Nipissing, Division of Mattawa:

- Francois Lamure, hunter, widower, age 60, Roman Catholic, residence Mattawa, father's name Joseph Lamure (hunter), mother's name Mary Whiteduck married Madeline Natowesi, widow, age 55, Roman Catholic, residing in Mattawa, surname of father Natowesi, mother unknown, in Mattawa on November 13, 1911. Witnesses Janbone Nyokwiwisens of Mattawa and Suzanne Stephens, registered November 14, 1911, priest Rev. G. Lemoine of Mattawa. (Note by Randy - Madeline was the widow of Ignace Bastien and Francois was the widower of Madeleine Chevrier. See Catholic church records of St. Anne in Mattawa, November 13, 1911.)

From Affidavit of Marriage under the Marriage Act, Schedule D, # 009788:

Particulars to be filled in by the
Clergyman performing

Marriage

I Heroby declare that I Married

Name of Husband <i>Joseph Whitbread Kelford</i>	
Name of Wife <i>Lozetta Manions</i>	
on the <i>22</i> day of <i>September</i> 19 <i>14</i>	
at the <i>Village</i> of <i>Calabogie</i>	
in the County of <i>Renfrew</i>	
by <i>L. H. B. 10445</i>	
Husband	Wife
Rank or Profession <i>Labourer</i>	Rank or Profession <i>Domestic</i>
Bachelor or Widower <i>Bachelor</i>	Spinster or Widow <i>Spinster</i>
Age <i>20</i> Years	Age <i>22</i> Years
Religious Denomination <i>Catholic</i>	Religious Denomination <i>Catholic</i>
Residence of Husband <i>Comanto, Co. Frontenac</i>	Residence of Wife <i>Polys, Co. Frontenac</i>
Name in full of Father of Husband <i>Joseph Whitbread</i>	Name in full of Father of Wife <i>William Manions</i>
Rank or Profession of Father of Husband <i>Labourer</i>	Rank or Profession of Father of Wife <i>Farmer</i>
Name and Maiden Name of Mother of Husband <i>Mary Kelford</i>	Name and Maiden Name of Mother of Wife <i>Margaret Doff</i>
Name and Address of Witnesses <i>Thomas Dillon</i>	<i>Calabogie</i>
<i>Annis Killoran</i>	<i>Calabogie</i>
Signature and Address of Person solemnizing Marriage. <i>William H. Downer, P.P.</i> <i>Calabogie</i>	



SCHEDULE D.
AFFIDAVIT.

Required before License or Certificate is Granted by Issuer of Marriage Licenses by provision of

The Marriage Act.

(Chapter 162, R. S. O. 1907.)

019463

I, *Joseph Kelford* of the *Parish* of *Comanto* in the *County* of *Frontenac* make oath and say as follows:—

1. That I and *Lozetta Manions* of the *Parish* of *Palmerston* in the *County* of *Frontenac* are desirous of entering into the Contract of Marriage, and of having our Marriage duly solemnized at the *Village* of *Calabogie* in the *County* of *Renfrew*

2. According to the best of my knowledge and belief, there is no affinity, consanguinity, prior marriage or any other lawful cause or legal impediment to bar or hinder the solemnization of the said Marriage.

3. I *Joseph Kelford* have had, since the *first* day of *January* 19*14* my usual place of abode within the municipality of *Comanto* in the *County* of *Frontenac*

4. I am of the age of *20* years, and the said *Lozetta Manions* is of the full age of eighteen years.

5. I am a *Bachelor* and the said *Lozetta Manions* is a *Spinster*

Sworn before me at *Lorant* in the *County* of *Lennox* this *thirtieth* day of *Sept* 19*14*
Joseph Kelford
J. H. Browning Issuer of Marriage Licenses at *Lorant*

* Or if neither of the parties has, for the space of fifteen days immediately preceding the issue of the certificate or license, had his or her usual place of abode in the county or district in which it is intended that the marriage shall be solemnized, add as follows: "The reason for procuring the marriage to be solemnized is set in order to evade the publicity or for any other improper purpose."

** If either party be under 16 and not a widow or widower, add: "E. D., of _____ in the county of _____ is the person whose consent to the said marriage is received by me, and the said E. D. consents to the said marriage. The proper writing hereto annexed marked "A" is the consent of the said E. D. to the said marriage, and the signature thereto is of the proper handwriting of the said E. D. The said E. D. is the father of the said C. D., or the said E. D. is the mother (or guardian duly appointed) of the said C. D., and the father of the said C. D. is dead (or the father and mother of the said C. D. are both dead) and no guardian of the said C. D. has been appointed."

Note.—This form to be varied as necessary in case the affidavit is made by the other party to the intended marriage.

332

Schedule A - BIRTHS

County of Frontenac

Division of Palmerston N. of C. County

When Born	No. 005903	No. 2 005904	No. 3 005905
Jan. 11 th 1879.	Jan. 9 th 1879	March 23 rd 1879	
Frank.	Samuel Alexander	Caroline	
M.	M.	F.	
Frank Sempierre	Alfred E. Webb	Charles E. Cross	
Isabella Lapointe	Maggie Bantson	Princess Cross	
Woman	Woman	Woman	
The Father, Palmerston	The Father, Palmerston	The Father, Palmerston	
July 20 th	July 20 th	July 24 th	
	D. Edgington	D. Edgington	
John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	
REMARKS			
No. 4 005906	No. 5 005907	No. 6 005908	
March 2 nd 1879	April 3 rd 1879	May 28 th 1879	
James Alexander	Elijah	Henry Ross	
M.	M.	F.	
William Hartley Moore	Hugh Cameron	Fabian Jacob	
Lizabell Walker	Susan Judge	Emma Landreault	
Woman	Woman	Woman	
The Father, Palmerston	The Father	The Father	
July 29 th	July 29 th	Aug 3 rd	
	John Edgington	D. Edgington	
John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	
REMARKS			

I hereby certify the foregoing to be the true and correct copies of all births returned to me for the half-year ending Jan 2 day of Jan 2 1879 A.D. 1879
 Given under my hand, this 2 day of Jan
 John Edgington M.D. Division Registrar of Palmerston N. of C. County

Schedule A - BIRTHS

County of Frontenac

Division of Palmerston N. of C. County

When Born	No. 7 005909	No. 8 005910	No. 9 005911
July 2 nd 1879	July 8 th 1879	July 8 th 1879	July 8 th 1879
James Eastman	James Henry	Annie Janet	
M.	M.	F.	
James Compton	James Rankin	James Pycroft	
Annie Massey	Maggie Bantson	Janet Watt	
Woman	Woman	Woman	
The Father, Palmerston	The Father, Palmerston	The Father, Palmerston	
Aug. 3 rd	Aug 7 th	Sept 7 th	
D. Edgington		(Aug) 7 th	
John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	
REMARKS			
No. 10 005912	No. 11 005913	No. 12 005914	
Sept. 22 nd 1879	Nov. 15 th 1879	April 13 th 1879	
Adolphus	Louis Michel	Henry	
M.	M.	M.	
Peter Carle	Michel R. Donale	John R. Donale	
Steph. Donley	Elija Carle	Chas. Sergeant	
Woman	Woman (Indian)	Woman	
The Father, S. Compton	The Father, S. Compton	The Father, Palmerston	
Sept. 29 th	Nov. 21 st	Nov. 21 st	
	D. Edgington		
John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	John Edgington M.D.	
REMARKS			

I hereby certify the foregoing to be the true and correct copies of all births returned to me for the half-year ending Jan 2 day of Jan 2 1879 A.D. 1879
 Given under my hand, this 2 day of Jan
 John Edgington M.D. Division Registrar of Palmerston N. of C. County

5314

SCHEDULE A - BIRTHS

County of Frontenac Division of Palmerston N. of S. Can.

When Born. 008094 No. 7 August 20 th 1880	008095 No. 8 August 20 th 1881	008096 No. 9 Sept. 24 th 1881
Name. Eliza Margaret	Henry M.	Gertrude Ann
Sex - Male or Female. F.	M.	F.
Name and Surname of Father. Gilbert Hamel	Josiah Amy	Joseph Hyde
Name and Maiden Surname of Mother. Lucy Brachanig	Maggie Basin	Sarah Ann Peay
Rank or Profession of Father. Yeoman.	Yeoman	Sailor. Farmer
Signature, Description and Residence of Informant. The Father. Palmerston.	The Father. South Carleton.	The Father. Palmerston.
When Registered. Sep. 15 th 1881.	Sept 15 th 1881.	Sept 29 th 1881
Name of Assessor. Dr. Edgington.		Dr. Edgington
Signature of Registrar. John Edgington.	John Edgington.	John Edgington
REMARKS.		
008097 No. 10. July 13 th 1881.	008098 No. 11 Sept 8 th 1881	008099 No. 12. Sept 12 th 1881
Name. William Alfred	MARY (Wife) ELLA DUNHAM	Anthon.
Sex - Male or Female. M.	F.	M.
Name and Surname of Father. Alfred B. Webb.	Henry Dunham	George Johnson
Name and Maiden Surname of Mother. Margaret Parkison	Annie Ward	Elizabeth Sty.
Rank or Profession of Father. Yeoman	Mail Contractor	Yeoman.
Signature, Description and Residence of Informant. The Father. Palmerston	The Father. Palmerston.	The Father. Palmerston.
When Registered. Sep. 30 th 1881.	Sept. 30 th 1881.	Sept 25 th 1881.
Name of Assessor. Dr. Edgington.	Dr. Edgington	
Signature of Registrar. John Edgington	John Edgington.	John Edgington.
REMARKS.	ALTERED AUTHORITY V. E. A. 1840 & 18 DATE MAY 5. 1898 BY M.F. C.F. No 953.	

I hereby certify the foregoing to be the true and correct copies of all Births returned to me for the half-year ending Dec. 31st 1881
Given under my hand, this 31st day of December 1881
John Edgington M.D. Division Registrar of Palmerston N. of S. Can.

SCHEDULE A - BIRTHS

County of Frontenac Division of Palmerston N. of S. Can.

008101 No. 13 Oct. 9 th 1881	008102 No. 14 Dec. 9 th 1881	008103 No. 15 March 17 th 1881	008104 No. 16 Aug. 9 th 1881
Name. Ida Fridalaya	Amy F.	Annie Jane	Annie Alexandra
Sex - Male or Female. F.	F.	F.	F.
Name and Surname of Father. Fabian Lebeaux	Robert Pratt.	Frank Sempario	Saml. Donaldson.
Name and Maiden Surname of Mother. Amy Landryville	Sophia M. Smith	Matilda Lapombase	Annie Allen.
Rank or Profession of Father. Yeoman.	Yeoman	Yeoman.	Yeoman.
Signature, Description and Residence of Informant. The Father. Palmerston.	The Father. Palmerston.	The Father. Palmerston.	The Father. Palmerston.
When Registered. Oct. 25 th 1881.	Dec. 15 th 1881.	Dec. 20 th 1881.	Dec 28 th 1881
Name of Assessor. Dr. Edgington.	Dr. Edgington		Dr. Edgington
Signature of Registrar. John Edgington.	John Edgington.	John Edgington.	John Edgington.
REMARKS.			

I hereby certify the foregoing to be the true and correct copies of all Births returned to me for the half-year ending Dec. 31st 1881
Given under my hand, this 31st day of December 1881
John Edgington M.D. Division Registrar of Palmerston N. of S. Can.