

The following submission is made by B. Majaury
in support of the inclusion of Ancestor Michel McDonald.

Joan Holmes Report

November 2022

For Michel McDonald

I noticed that there was no mention of proof of fraud, new information or serious error in the 2013 decision by Superior Court Justice (retired) James Chadwick.

The report gave the impression that Michel McDonald, if born in Ontario, could be Ojibwa, Cree or Algonquin. That could be true, except for the fact that there is no documented proof that he was closely associated with any Cree or Ojibwa people, only Algonquin people.

With regard to Michel McDonald being born in Manitoba, people will believe what they wish to believe, but I have difficulty understanding that a person, such as Michel McDonald, who didn't read or write, living in rural Renfrew County in 1871, would know that he was born approximately thirty years earlier in a distant province only officially named less than a year earlier in 1870. What makes it even more difficult for me to believe, is the fact that he apparently didn't know his parent's names. Furthermore, after searches by several genealogists there have been no records of his birth in the province of Manitoba, or any record of him living in that area of Canada as an adult. Four of his children stated that his birth place was Ontario, the same as stated in the 1881 Census. It is not unreasonable to confuse Manitoulin with Manitoba, especially when said in broken English.

All records as provided by the Joan Holmes organization, and through our searches have him living in traditional Algonquin territory, associated with Algonquin people.

The death record of his third wife Elizabeth shows that she died the same day their son Joseph was born in 1893. The only record available is the 1901 Census, which records Sarah Whiteduck, the cousin of his first two wives, living in the home, and described as a servant. She was looking after the children. Since Elizabeth died in 1893 it would be reasonable for Sarah Whiteduck to have been in the home long before the 1901 Canadian Census. All of the McDonald family including the children would have had a close relationship with the other Algonquin lines in the traditional Algonquin territory, and that is stated in an email that I have from Joan Holmes.

As recently as the 1921 Canadian Census, children and grandchildren of Michel McDonald, including my mother, were identified as Indian.

Several years ago I had the opportunity of attending the 90th birthday of the late Mary, the daughter of Peter McDonald and Katherine Pierre. She told me that she remembered her father taking her as a child to visit Sarah Whiteduck.

In doing this complex work, errors are made when listening to oral history, even professionals make innocent errors. For example The Joan Holmes report states that "Peter McDonald married his second cousin Catherine Pierre". That would only be the case if Peter was the son of either of Michel McDonald's first two wives, but he was not.

The Holmes report is correct when it states that the 1881 Census identifies Michel McDonald as (Scotch Ind.)," with IND stoked across. It is also correct when it says the children were identified as Scotch the same as their father, but I am in possession of a SCHEDULE A BIRTHS for Palmerston /North Cononto

005913 Nov. 15 1879 Xavier Michel In, Michel McDonald/ Eliza Arkle. Yoman (Indian) The Father South Cononto.

J. Eglington Nov ??

#008102 Dec. 10th 1881 Michele In, Michel McDonald/ Eliza Arkle. Indian. The Father. South Cononto

Dec.17 1881

John Eglington

Palmerston

Please see attachment.

Submitted by: Robert Majaury

Document #6
from address

brothers
of # 2

TABLE A - BIRTHS

NAME *Salvatore Nod. L...*

005913
Mar. 15 1895
Lover *Michele*
Michele *R. P. Grace*
Eugene *Castle*
Hudson *(Hudson)*
The father
J. J. *Carroll*
Wm. *W. W.*
St. *Augustine*

008102
Dec. 18 1894
Michele
Michele *R. P. Grace*
Eugene *Castle*
Hudson
The father
South *Carroll*
Dec 19 1894
John *Palmerston*

